

Indonesia: UNCT Gender Performance Indicators

June 2012

Froniga Greig

Table of Contents

1	METHODOLOGY	3
2	FINDINGS	3
	<i>Summary</i>	3
	<i>Strengths</i>	4
	<i>Weaknesses</i>	5
3	FOLLOW UP	6
	ANNEX. 1. PEOPLE CONSULTED	9
	ANNEX 2. DOCUMENTS REVIEWED	11
	ANNEX 3. TIMEFRAME FOR CONSULTANCY	12
	ANNEX 4. TERMS OF REFERENCE	13

1 METHODOLOGY

The UNCT Gender Performance Indicators assessments (scorecard) was conducted from December 2011 – May 2012. Typically, this exercise is conducted during a shorter time period, however, the UNCT in Indonesia allocated more time to ensure that the consultant had the opportunity to meet with all relevant stakeholders. A total of 20 interviews were conducted with UN staff (representing 11 agencies, funds and programs), government and representatives from civil society.¹ Participation in the scorecard process was by invitation to all UNCT members. UN Women and the UNGTWG (gender thematic working group) facilitated the implementation of the scorecard.

2 FINDINGS

Summary

The UNCT has an active UN gender thematic working group, a joint program on eliminating violence against women in Papua and gender and a plethora of examples of UN agencies working together on gender issues, such as the UPR report, CEDAW response and gender audit methodology. The ILO gender audit methodology has been shared with UN agencies through the gender theme group and has since been rolled out by some UN agencies to their own government and civil society partners. Several UN agencies are also working together to understand and assess the impact of the new breastfeeding law on women.

The UNCT in Indonesia has several gender experts working within UN agencies and programs that are committed and heavily involved in the UNDAF process. The co-Chairs of the UNGTWG are also active and play a critical role in keeping gender on the agenda at UNCT meetings.

The one area of the scorecard, which has let the UNCT down, is, partnerships. Section 3, partnerships questions the participation and ongoing involvement of government, civil society and vulnerable or marginalized women in the UNDAF process. Although there were examples of government partners participating in the UNDAF process, some agencies and programs felt that the time for consultation was limited and that the process was Bappenas-centric. Perhaps more concerning is the limited consultation with civil society groups (specifically on gender equality issues) and the clear articulation of an ongoing role for them throughout the UNDAF cycle.

¹ See Annex 1. For a complete list of participants.

Table 1. Summary of scores.²

1. Planning	4.8
2. Programming	4.5
3. Partnerships	3.6
4. Policies and Capacities	4
5. Decision making	4
6. Budgeting	3.5
7. Monitoring and evaluation	4
8. Quality assurance and accountability	4

Strengths

- Almost 100% of the outputs (referred to in the UNPDF as sub-outcomes) clearly articulate how gender equality and women's empowerment will be promoted. Although the language used in the UNPDF is not always immediately recognizable as gender responsive (for example, beneficiaries are described as the vulnerable, marginalized or poor), the descriptions included under each sub-outcome do articulate whether the UNCT will be working with youth, women, girls etc.
- Gender equality considerations have been integrated into more than half of the UNPDF indicators. 100% of indicators under the gender outcome areas are gender sensitive.
- Programming within the UNCT meets government priorities.
- UNGTWG has been active in engendering the monitoring and evaluation framework for the UNPDF (UNDAF).
- Coordination across UNCT occurring at various levels. UNGTWG but also the H4+ group working on maternal health which includes World Bank, WHO, UNAIDS, UNFPA, UNICEF. 2012 provides UNCT further opportunities to address gender priorities, for example the violence study.
- UNCT has worked together to support the national gender machinery and government in general in the area of CEDAW, gender audits, policy development and gender budgeting within the government.
- UNGTWG and other working groups are harmonizing work plans for the first time. This will enhance opportunities to work together and avoid overlap.

² It was not possible to allocate higher scores in these areas due to the rigidity of the scorecard tool. For example, the section on budgeting rewards specific budgets for catalyzing gender programming and activities, however, most agencies would agree that un-earmarked funds are seldom available, not just for gender.

- Most agencies use a gender marker for project approval.
- UNGTWG provides capacity building opportunities for the UNCT through brown bag lunches, training, resources and inductions.
- Gender experts from within the UNCT and at regional and headquarters level provide technical input to plans and programs ensuring quality and accountability on gender equality.

Weaknesses

- The UNCT Indonesia promotes thinking and working together but this does not necessarily translate as programming together. While there are abundant examples of two or more UN agencies identifying synergies and working together on joint initiatives, joint programming is still in its infancy.
- An observation of the two gender joint programs is the need for better communication and working together. According to the UN agencies and programs planning requirements have resulted in the joint programs following their own planning and reporting cycles.
- At present joint programs have not been developed in a systematic way and so there has not been any formal mechanism of screening programs.
- Resources such as IEC materials, checklists and rosters are not being shared.
- Government partners fully participated in the development of the UNPDF. Some UN agencies feel that the UN should not have focused on Bappenas as line ministries do not report to Bappenas.
- Civil society groups did not participate in UNPDF development and are not involved in monitoring. In fact, most civil society groups were not familiar with UN programs and work on gender equality.
- All of the larger agencies have their own expert rosters. Often the rosters are managed at the regional level. Some specialized agencies also draw on international expertise from headquarters. It seems that none of the agencies have any difficulty accessing help, however, there is a tendency to ask experts within your own agency even when they are far away.
- Government of Indonesia and UN has different interpretations and understanding of gender and development. Partners have interpreted the UNPDF focus on enhancing results for women and a focus on vulnerability and women as a priority group as a swing back to Women in Development (WID).
- Evidence of agencies doing gender budgeting but no concerted effort to ensure that the UNPDF includes a gender budget.

- Although some agencies have small budgets to catalyze or stimulate programming on gender, these budgets are not being pooled. Agencies do pool funds for UNGTWG activities but not for programming. UNCT has tapped UN Trust fund.
- Accountability mechanism for gender within the UNPDF is weak. Bappenas are not really in a position to have technical oversight at that level because UNPDF is the responsibility of the multi-lateral department in Bappenas. While social units comment on gender integration during development of UNPDF they don't play a role in ongoing monitoring of the framework.

3 DETAILED LIST OF FOLLOW UP

Focus area	Score	Follow up
1. Planning	4.8	1. It is essential that all work plans for the UNPDF outcome areas not only include gender consideration but that they are tracked throughout the year. Often UNCT gender work is responsive and can develop through informal networks. When gender work is not articulated in work plans or through reporting it is difficult to keep track of results. If gender activities are not included in work plans at the start of the year, there needs to be a mechanism for them to be included and reported on mid-year.
2. Programming	4.5	2. UNGTWG Approval of Joint programs. Could be a checklist for each joint program or each JP could be submitted to the UNGTWG for comment. Adapt marker or checklist from existing tools in other UN agencies (eg. UNDP).
3. Partnerships	3.6	3. UNGTWG to maintain a list of civil society groups and NGOs working on gender equality. 4. UN and government to facilitate discussions on UN programming two times per year. This can be via an open invitation to the planning and review forum or through a separate networking conference. If there is a budget, it would be good to commission academic institutes and civil society groups to conduct research or monitoring on gender equality issues.

		Government (MOWE) has already expressed interest in hosting these meetings. 5. UNGTWG should follow up with the World Bank, ADB, CIDA and AusAID gender network. The UN could participate in this network and periodically invite other development partners to participate in the UN gender group. 6. Maintain an updated matrix for dissemination (publication on website) to development partners on UNCT work on gender equality. 7. Close the gap between government and UN understanding / interpretation of gender and development through improved communication and participation in coordination mechanisms such as UN gender theme group.
4. Policies and Capacities	4	8. UNGTWG could conduct a needs assessment or set up a help desk service to encourage UNCT capacity development on gender equality. The help desk would also assist in identifying problem areas or obstacles to working together on gender, which could then be taken to UNCT meetings for further action. 9. Share resources such as guidelines, checklists, IEC materials via the intranet or UN Indonesia website. 10. UNGTWG could suggest a range of themes for brown bag lunches, which could be prioritized by staff to enhance participation and interest. 11. The UNCT roster could be updated and managed by the RC or by UN Women (mandated to coordinate gender system). Once the intranet is up and running a roster could be established and maintained. 12. UNGTWG to review the gender equality training module included in the staff

		induction.
5. Decision making	4	13. Invite country representatives and deputies to attend two UNGTWG meetings per year. These meetings would focus on planning activities for the forthcoming year and reviewing the previous year activities.
6. Budgeting	3.5	14. Ensure that gender equality considerations are integrated into the audit process. 15. Conduct an internal analysis of spending on gender within the UNPDF. 16. There is scope to create a small budget to catalyze gender equality work through the gender group. At present the gender group fundraises on an activity-by-activity basis, however, the group could fundraise at the time of developing their work plan and ensure provision for some activities.
7. Monitoring and evaluation	4	17. UNGTWG review the final work plans of each group twice per year (once it is finalized and then by way of monitoring) to ensure that gender considerations are included.
8. Quality control and accountability	4	18. Establish thematic working groups (for example, justice, VAW) with development partners as a way of enhancing UN accountability to work towards gender results in the UNPDF and involvement of technical specialists.

ANNEX. 1. PEOPLE CONSULTED

1	UN Resident Coordinator	El-Mostafa Benlamlih United Nations Resident Coordinator Indonesia
2	ILO	Peter van Rooij, Representative, Lusiani Julia and Sara Park, Gender Focal Point
3	IOM	Kartini Pouchous, Gender Focal Point
4	UNAIDS	Nancy Fee, Country Coordinator and Rebeka Sultana (Gender Focal Point), Dr. Lely Wahyuniar (National Program Officer)
5	UNDP	Stephen Rodrigues, Deputy Country Representative and Rini Widiastuti (Gender Focal Point, Project Management and Evaluation Unit)
6	UNESCO	Ahmimed Charaf, Chair of UN Human Rights Working Group
7	UNFPA	Jose Ferraris, Country Representative; Martha Santoso Ismail, Assistant Representative and Lany Harijanti, National Programme Officer - Gender
8	UNICEF	Angela Kearney, Country Representative, Karen Manda (Gender Focal Point) and M&E Specialist
9	UN Women	Janet Wong Country Program Manager (Acting) Dwi Faiz, National Program Officer Economic Security and Rights
10	UN OCCHA	Ignacio Leon-Garcia (Head of OCHA Indonesia), Knarik Kamalyan (Humanitarian Affairs Officer), Wahyu Srigandani (Administrative Officer), Mindaraga Rahardja (Iwan) (Emergency Response Officer), Faizal Thamrin (Information Management Associate)
11	WHO	Sharad Adhikary (Environmental Health Advisor), Triningtyasasih (Medical Anthropologist gender, equity and human rights for health)
12	Ministry of Women's Affairs	Erni Teguh, Head of Planning Bureau
13	CWGI – CEDAW Working Group Indonesia	Estu Fanani, Coordinator
14	Kalyanimitra	Rena Herdiyani, Executive Director
15	Women's Health Foundation (Yayasan Kesehatan Perempuan)	Atas Hendartini Habsyah, Executive Director
16	Rumpun Gena Perempuan	Aida Milasari, Chair

	(protection of women domestic workers' rights and education)	
17	Mitra Perempuan Centre (Women's crisis centre)	Yeni Ampriani (counselor)
18	Rainbow Alliance for mixed families (women's rights in inter-cultural marriage)	Dewi Tjakrawinata, chair
19	RAHIMA Education women's rights and Islam	AD Eridani, Chair
20	Bappenas	Dr. Sanjoyo, Director for Population, Women's Empowerment and Child Protection; Fitriyah, Head of Bureau for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection
21	Komnas Perempuan	Desti Murdijana (Vice Chairperson)

ANNEX 2. DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

1. CEDAW related documents (state report to the Committee, Concluding Comments to the State Report)
2. Scorecard and Users' Guide
3. Indonesia Medium Term National Development Plan (RPJMN) and UNPDF
4. UNDG – Guidelines for UN Country Teams on Preparing a CCA and UNDAF (2009)
5. UNCT planning and programming documents
6. UNCT budgets, Joint Program budgets
7. Indonesian Government gender mainstreaming policy documents
8. CPAPs and workplans for agencies
9. Jakarta Commitments
10. UPR submission by the UN

ANNEX 3. TIMEFRAME FOR CONSULTANCY

Activity	Number of days	Date
Background document review: ➤ Scorecard and Users' Guide ➤ Indonesia Medium Term National Development Plan (RPJMN) and UNPDF ➤ undg – Guidelines for UN Country Teams on Preparing a CCA and UNDAF (2009) ➤ UNCT planning and programming documents ➤ UNCT budgets, Joint Program budgets ➤ Indonesian Government gender mainstreaming policy documents ➤ CEDAW related documents (state report to the Committee, Concluding Comments to the State Report)	5	December
Interviews: ➤ Resident Coordinator and UNCT ➤ Gender Thematic Working Group ➤ UNPDF Working Group and other inter-agency working groups ➤ Other UN staff ➤ Counterparts, including women's groups, civil society and government ministries Approximately 15-20 interviews	7	January – April
Completion of draft Scorecard and narrative report	4	April
Deliberation Workshop	½ day	May
Verbal debriefing with RC/UNCT, completion of final Scorecard, narrative report and follow-up matrix, and debrief with undg Task Team	3 ½	May
Total	20	December - May

ANNEX 4. TERMS OF REFERENCE

Post Title:	Consultant
Duty Station:	Indonesia
Contract Type:	Contract for Consultant (CFC)
Contract No.:	
Contract Duration:	November 2011 – March 2012
Total Number of Days:	20 days
Duty Station:	Jakarta, Indonesia

1. Background

At the 59th Session of the UN General Assembly, Member States, in adopting the Triennial Comprehensive Policy Review (TCPR) of Operational Activities for Development of the UN System called on all UN organizations to:

mainstream gender and to pursue gender equality in their country programmes, planning instruments and sector-wide programmes and to articulate specific country-level goals and targets in this field in accordance with the national development strategies.³

Further, ECOSOC Resolution 2004/4 - *Review of Economic and Social Council agreed conclusions 1997/2 on mainstreaming the gender perspective into all policies and programs in the United Nations system* requested: 'the Secretary-General to ensure that all United Nations entities develop action plans with time lines for implementing the agreed conclusions 1997/2, which address the gap between policy and practice identified in the Secretary-General's report, with a view to strengthening commitment and accountability at the highest levels within the United Nations system as well as to establishing mechanisms to ensure accountability, systematic monitoring and reporting on progress in implementation.'

As a direct follow-up to the TCPR, and to ensure a comprehensive response to many of its recommendations, the UN Development Group (UNDG) created a Task Team on Gender Equality as a sub-group of the UNDG Program Group. The goals of the Task Team are: to support more consistent and coherent action among UNDG member agencies to mainstream gender equality and promote women's empowerment at the country level; and to ensure that gender equality and women's empowerment are mainstreamed into the wide range of tools and processes that emerge from the UNDG for use by UN Country Teams (UNCTs).

³ UN (2005) *Resolution adopted by the General Assembly. 59/250. Triennial comprehensive policy review of operational activities for development of the United Nations system*. New York: A/RES/59/250, p.13.

In 2006 the undg Task Team on Gender Equality commissioned a background paper on accountability mechanisms in undg agencies. This paper⁴ reviewed accountability for programming in support of gender equality in ILO, UNDP, UNFPA, UNICEF, and WFP and found that:

“A common understanding of how to apply gender mainstreaming in UN operational activities is needed. This is because if there is no agreement on what constitutes a minimum level of actions to support gender equality, how will it be possible to hold agencies and UN Country Teams accountable for this? Reaching agreement across agencies on what constitutes a minimally acceptable performance to support gender equality, through an agreed set of indicators, would contribute to stronger guidance and accountability.”

Subsequently this background paper was endorsed at the undg Principals’ meeting in July 2006, where agreement was reached on development of a UNCT-level ‘Accounting for Gender Equality’ Scorecard that sets minimum standards for UNCTs to assess their performance, and to identify gaps and progress across the system.

2. The UNCT in Indonesia

There are currently 27 UN agencies, funds and programmes operating in Indonesia, of which 18 are members of the country team. The current UN Partnership for Development Framework (UNPDF)⁵ runs from 2011 to 2015. The five outcomes identified for the UNPDF have been designed to link directly to the 11 national priorities articulated in the Indonesian Government’s National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN 2010–2014). These priorities fully mainstream Sustainable Development, Good Governance and Gender perspectives in their implementation and operational framework.

There are two joint programmes on gender in the UN system in Indonesia, namely *Combating Violence against Women and Girls in Papua Province, Indonesia* and *Protecting and Empowering Victims of Trafficking in Indonesia (EMPOWER)*. The coordination mechanism for gender mainstreaming in the UN system in Indonesia is facilitated by the inter-agency UN Gender Thematic Working Group (UNGTWG), co-chaired by UNFPA and UN Women. This will be the first Gender Scorecard exercise for the UN Country Team in Indonesia.

3. Purpose of the Scorecard exercise

- To assist UNCTs in identifying areas in which they are meeting or not meeting minimum standards.
- To stimulate a constructive dialogue within the UNCT about the current status of gender mainstreaming and how it can be improved.
- To identify where technical assistance can support the achievement of minimum standards.
- To support the sharing of good practice in gender mainstreaming and the promotion of gender equality.

4. Purpose and requirements of the consultancy

4

<http://www.undg.org/search.cfm?x=0&y=0&by=keywords&q=tony+beck&country>

⁵ <http://un.or.id/sites/default/files/UNPDF%20INDONESIA%202010-2015.pdf>

A consultant is required to implement the Scorecard as follows:

5. Required Qualifications and Competencies

- In-depth knowledge of gender mainstreaming and UN programs
- At least 10 years experience of work on gender mainstreaming
- At least five years experience of work on results based management
- Master degree in political science, gender and development or related field
- Ability to interact with all levels of UN staff and counterparts including Government and civil society
- Excellent written and oral communication skills in English; a working knowledge of Indonesian would be an advantage
- Ability to complete the Scorecard, narrative report and follow-up matrix in English, experience in conducting scorecard in other countries is preferable